November 2023



Women's Aid
Submission to the An
Garda Síochána
Strategic Plan 2025 2027 Consultation







November 2023

Summary of Recommendations

- 2.1 The proactive approach of Operation Faoiseamh should continue and should be included in the Strategic Plan. This should include proactive monitoring and enforcing of orders under the Domestic Violence Act 2018.
- 2.2 Training on domestic violence and abuse should be prioritised, both at foundation level in the Garda College and as CDP for serving Gardaí in order to ensure a consistent response in line with the Garda Domestic Abuse Intervention Policy. The training should include an understanding of the dynamics of domestic violence and abuse, especially coercive control, and should be designed and delivered in conjunction with relevant specialist support services. Training should be provided to all members of An Garda Síochána that may respond to and/or investigate a domestic abuse call. CAD dispatchers should also be trained.
- 2.3 Training on prosecuting new offences, especially image based sexual abuse and stalking, should be provided and should include correct protocols for evidence collection.

- 2.4 Monitoring of the consistent implementation of the Domestic Abuse Intervention policy and domestic abuse case supervision should be strengthened.
- 2.5 Risk assessment should be rolled out nationally to all victims of domestic abuse and must include **their children**. The Risk Assessment tool should be further refined to take into consideration the factors mentioned in GREVIO's recommendation 44.
- 2.6 An evaluation of the initial roll out of the Risk Assessment Tool should be undertaken to include significant input from specialist DVA services and victims-survivors who have experienced administration of this tool.
- 2.7 Improving prosecution for domestic violence and abuse related offences, including but not limited to breaches of DV orders and coercive control, should remain a priority in the new Strategic Plan. This should include conducting a review of current practices.
- 2.8 Gardai who act in the role of prosecution for breaches of orders and other domestic abuse offences, must be trained to do so effectively, including in relation to circumstances where refusal of bail may be applied for, even regarding summary offences, where there is a significant potential risk of harm to the victim-survivor.
- 2.9 Victim-centric information and communication processes need to be developed so that domestic abuse victims are informed and prepared for attending criminal court as witnesses.
- 2.10 A formal process of continuous 'spot' checking by senior members of both technical systems and CAD dispatcher responses and data recording should be put in place to ensure all domestic violence calls are responded to.

- 2.11 Information sharing procedures and systems within the Justice System and where appropriate Tusla need to be developed and applied.
- 2.12 Resources must be made available to put supportive protocols and case management systems in place. Gardaí staffing should be adequately resourced so that there is consistent capacity to support women and engagement with Domestic Violence Services and these roles should be specially trained and resourced.
- 2.13 Protocols for keeping victims informed of their cases should be developed.
- 2.14 Continue the roll out of Domestic Abuse Coordination Teams nationally and fully resource them.
- 2.15 That clear guidelines on how Garda would deal with domestic violence cases when the perpetrator is a member of (or a friend of) a Garda or Garda informant are developed and made available to the public.
- 2.16 Findings of Assistant Commissioner Clavin's review on domestic, sexual, gender-based violence and coercive control related crimes involving Gardaí perpetrators should be published. Any recommendations should be enacted to mitigate risk and ensure transparency and public confidence.
- 2.17 Effective measures should be put in place to ensure that the requirement that Members of An Garda Síochána to report the existence of an order, for which they are a respondent, under the Domestic Violence Act 2018 in accordance with An Garda Síochána's Domestic Abuse Intervention Policy, to the Internal Affairs Unit is complied with in all cases.

- 2.18 Similarly, when the mechanism for victims of stalking to apply for civil restraining orders is commenced (Criminal Justice (Miscellaneous Provisions) Act 2023), members of the Gardaí must be obliged to disclose to their employer if they are subject to any such order.
- 2.19 Suitable risk mitigation measures should be implemented to protect victims-survivors and ensure confidence in the Institution if the perpetrator is a Member of An Garda Síochána.
- 2.20 Recruitment screening processes for Garda members should include exclusion if they have been subject to credible allegations of domestic abuse.
- 2.21 Actions to improve trust and reporting by minority groups and response to them should be included in the Strategic Plan in line with Action 4.6.2 of the Third National Strategy on Domestic, Sexual and Gender-based violence[1].
- 2.22 Increasing dedicated community liaison roles and training Garda members in anti-racism, unconscious bias and trauma informed responses particularly to support better engagement with victims of DSGBV among minoritized groups should be actions in the new strategy.
- 3.1 Women's Aid would be delighted to provide more regular training and have indicated our willingness to bring our decades of best practice training expertise and collaborate with those involved in designing and delivering training to members on this subject.
- 3.2 When new relevant legislation is enacted, it may be useful for Garda and specialist services to have joint inter-agency training on it. An example where this could be considered are the recently

- enacted offences of non-fatal strangulation/suffocation[2] to understand why this is so important and high risk.
- 4.1 Women's Aid recommends that AGS new Strategic Plan should include a commitment to serving orders, particularly in relation to emergency barring orders, interim barring orders and barring orders under the Domestic Violence Act 2018, to perpetrators.
- 4.2 The Strategic Plan should include measures to monitor and if necessary, support the use of S24 of the Domestic Violence Act 2018.
- 4.3 Include measures to strengthened Gardaí providing evidence in Domestic Violence Act applications and in access and custody applications in which there is underlying domestic or sexual violence
- 4.4 Consider how to implement Recommendations 6.2.4, 6.2.6,6.2.7 in the Egan and O'Malley Dunlop Report
- 4.5 Implement and report on Action 3.2.2 of the Third National Strategy on DSGBV.
- 4.6 The Strategic Plan should consider relevant actions to implement Recommendations in Chapters Four and Six of the Study on Familicide & Domestic and Family Violence Death Reviews.
- 4.7 To repeat the Domestic, Sexual and Gender-Based Violence report on a regular basis, including information on new relevant offences.

- 4.8 That the domestic abuse section in Garda website is updated to include information on the Garda structures dealing with domestic abuse and relevant Garda policy, including when perpetrators are members of AGS.
- 5.1 Women's Aid suggests a focus on online crime, particularity online violence against women and children as one of the Pillars for the next strategy. Contrasting these crimes will require increased resources and specific skills, not easily or quickly acquired, which should be planned for in the next Strategy.



Contents

Introduction	8
About Women's Aid	8
Domestic Violence and Abuse as a Crime	9
1. What are the policing and community safety issues most relevant you?	
Domestic abuse, including coercive control, is the most relevant policing and community safety issue for Women's Aid	
2. What do Gardaí do well and what can we improve on in respect o the above?	
Positive responses	12
Negative responses	14
Lack of understanding of Domestic abuse and of legislation	16
Lack of Consistency	17
Communication and information sharing	18
Domestic Violence Liaison Gardaí / Domestic Abuse Coordination Teams	19
Risk assessment	20
Issues with arrests, charging and investigations	21
Training	
CAD/Emergency call responses	24
Recommendations:	
Gardaí as Offenders or Friends of Offenders	26
Recommendations:	28
Recommendations:	29
3. How can we work in partnership with you, or with other partners, further ensure the safety of our communities?	
Expansion of High-Risk Support Project	30
Training	
Training on new legislation	



Recommendations:	32
4. An Garda Síochána is a victim-centred organisation, how can w further collaborate with our partners, in a proactive and inclusive w to support victims and serve our communities to the highest standa 32	ay,
Serving of Orders under the Domestic Violence Act 2018	33
Recommendations:	33
Special sittings under S24	34
Recommendation:	34
Collaboration in other legal processes to support victims	35
Recommendations:	36
Domestic and family violence deaths/familicides	37
Recommendation:	37
Data on Domestic abuse	37
Recommendation:	38
Information on Garda organisational structure for responding to domestic abuse	38
Recommendation:	38
5. Are there any other areas you feel should be considered for inclusion in our next strategy period?	39
Recommendation:	39

Introduction

About Women's Aid

Women's Aid is a national, feminist organisation working to prevent and address the impact of domestic violence and abuse (henceforth referred to as DVA) including coercive control, in Ireland since 1974. We do this by advocating, influencing, training, and campaigning for effective responses to reduce the scale and impact of DVA on women and



children in Ireland and providing high quality, specialised, integrated, support services. More information on Women's Aid is available on our website www.womensaid.ie.

Women's Aid welcomes the opportunity to make a submission to the An Garda Síochána Strategic Plan 2025 - 2027 Consultation. Women's Aid recognize that An Garda Siochana(AGS) play a vital role in both victim support and perpetrator accountability. This submission, in line with Women's Aid primary purpose, will focus primarily on An Garda Síochána's response to domestic abuse.

Domestic Violence and Abuse as a Crime

In 2022¹ Women's Aid heard 28,578 disclosures of abuse against women including:

- 20,851 disclosures of emotional abuse
- 4,509 disclosures of physical abuse
- 2,290 disclosures of economic abuse
- 928 disclosures of sexual abuse, including 393 disclosures of rape to the National Helpline
- 663 disclosures of digital abuse and cyber-stalking

We also heard of 5,412 disclosures of abuse against children, including 315 disclosures of physical abuse and 91 of sexual abuse.

Many of these acts would correspond to offences under various Acts, including the Non-Fatal Offences Against the Person Act 1997, sexual offences legislation, coercive control (Domestic Violence Act 2018), image-based sexual abuse (Harassment, Harmful Communications and Related Offences Act 2020) and the very recent offences of non-fatal

¹ Women's Aid Annual Impact Report 2022, https://www.womensaid.ie/app/uploads/2023/07/womens_aid_annual_impact_report_2022_embargoed_0001_20623.pdf

strangulation/suffocation, harassment and stalking (Criminal Justice (Miscellaneous Provisions) Act 2023).

In the worst-case scenario, domestic abuse ends in murder. Women's Aid Femicide Watch estimates that 264 women have died violently between 1996-present in Ireland and 55% of the resolved cases were killed by a partner or ex-partner².

In many cases women do not report the abuse they are subjected to the Gardaí, but when they do the responses they receive from Gardaí are critical to their current and future safety and to their willingness to engage with the criminal justice system as well as with the child protection and civil courts systems³.

1. What are the policing and community safety issues most relevant to you?

Domestic abuse is very common in Ireland and comprises a range of crimes and offences, often repeated. The excellent 2022 AGS *Report on Domestic, sexual and gender-based violence* confirms that domestic abuse is a huge and increasing part of every day's work of Gardaí and represents a huge proportion of crimes against women⁴.

Domestic abuse, including coercive control, is the most relevant policing and community safety issue for Women's Aid.

Other related and important policing and community safety issues include all other forms of gender-based violence, in particular, sexual violence. Which is very prevalent outside of and within intimate

² https://www.womensaid.ie/app/uploads/2023/10/Womens-Aid-Femicide-Watch-1996-2023.pdf

³ Egan, N. and O'Malley Dunlop, E. (2023) A Report on the Intersection of the Criminal Justice, Private Family Law and Public Law Child Care Processes in Relation to Domestic and Sexual Violence. Department of Justice and the National Women's Council. Available at: https://www.nwci.ie/images/uploads/NWC DoJ DSV Justice Report.pdf

⁴ An Garda Síochána, 2022, DOMESTIC, SEXUAL AND GENDER-BASED VIOLENCE A Report on Crime Levels and Garda Operational Responses

relationships, as evidence by the recent Central Statistics Office sexual violence survey⁵.

Online gender-based violence, is also increasing and very concerning and should be prioritised, including crimes of intimate image abuse (image-based sexual abuse), online monitoring and stalking, and harassment within and outside of intimate relationships.

2. What do Gardaí do well and what can we improve on in respect of the above?

Women's Aid greatly appreciate the huge progress made in recent years by AGS including the proactive approach which started with Operation Faoiseamh during Covid-19; the establishment of Divisional Protective Services Units; the establishment of Domestic Abuse Coordinator Teams (DACTs) in some areas (DRM divisions particularly); the improvement in training, including on the subject of coercive control for some members.

We are also encouraged by the increasing recognition of coercive control, with the number of incidents of **coercive control** being recorded rising steadily since 2020, up to a total of 481 incidents recorded to December last year⁶. This demonstrates a welcome understanding that domestic violence is commonly based on a persistent pattern of abusive behaviours and a recognition that abuse is not defined by physical violence only.

In Women's Aid we record feedback (unsolicited) from callers to the 24hr National Freephone Helpline, about their experiences with members of AGS. In 2023, up to the end of October, callers to the 24hr National Freephone Helpline disclosed that they had rang the Gardaí on 2,300 occasions, with 204 women having rang the Gardaí more than

⁵ https://www.cso.ie/en/releasesandpublications/ep/p-svsmr/sexualviolencesurvey2022mainresults/data/

⁶ https://www.finegael.ie/offence-of-coercive-control-should-be-extended-to-people-in-a-non-intimate-relationship-odowd/

once. Women mentioned that the Gardaí was helpful in 909 occasions and unhelpful in 647⁷.

There continues to be a concerning lack of consistency in the response provided by Gardaí to women experiencing domestic violence and abuse. It is the Divisional Units rather than the specialist DPUs who respond in the main to domestic violence and abuse call outs. Responses range from very poor to excellent depending on the Garda station or even on the individual Garda that the woman speaks to within that same station.

Positive responses

When Gardaí follow their own Domestic Abuse Intervention Policy, feedback from victims-survivors is very positive. Recent examples of positive responses from An Garda Síochána which victims-survivors disclosed to Women's Aid include:

- · responding rapidly to emergency calls
- arresting when there is breach of an order under the Domestic Violence Act 2018
- arresting perpetrators for assaults and/or other offences (including when there is no order)
- following up where there is a suspicion of a breach/other crime having been committed in terms of reporting, statements, sending files to DPP, communicating with the victim re court dates, confirming/explaining outcomes of proceedings
- contacting the victim/survivor by phone or in person /coming back and checking on her regularly, keeping her informed

⁷ Please note that the information noted here relates to details and facts disclosed by women in the process of their contact with Women's Aid. As the primary aim of this service is to provide support and information to women, Women's Aid does not solicit any information for statistical purposes. This is <u>not</u> therefore a statistical survey/research on satisfaction with Garda responses in relation to domestic violence and abuse.



- taking domestic violence and abuse seriously. When Gardaí are able to communicate sensitively and recognise domestic violence survivors have been through trauma, women report trust in the Gardaí as a whole, and are more likely to report and follow through with cases.
- collecting evidence for a charge of coercive control
- encouraging her to call them again
- offering correct information on orders, including eligibility requirements
- referring her to support services, calling services with her or on her behalf
- offering support around court dates, attending hearings for protective orders and breaches or for other offences, and objecting to bail when there is a risk of harm
- when a woman is applying for a protective order or where there is a breach thereof, providing the Court with relevant information from the Gardai on call outs and breaches
- assisting women in getting to refuges or other safe locations
- improving safety for women and children (providing advice on security, regular patrols etc.)
- removing firearms
- serving the order to the respondent so the woman would not have to do it herself
- having a dedicated Garda acting as a point of contact, managing the case and keeping the woman informed of any developments
- understanding that a domestic violence and abuse arrest is not just an arrest for a minor offense and can prevent more serious crimes



We note that where there is a zero-tolerance culture in terms of domestic violence and abuse in a station, led by the Inspector or the DPSU and the unit Sergeants there is a proactive policing response at all levels.

This proactive approach includes:

- using the risk assessment tool and then ensure that every possible action is taken to manage the identified risks and respond to incidents
- active case managing to ensure follow up from the individual Gardaí
- following up all reports of domestic violence and abuse incidents and actively seeking arrest, keeping woman informed
- systematic objection to bail;

Cooperation between shifts, stations, and units is key to achieve safety and prevention in known repeat domestic violence and abuse cases. The opposite is individual pieces of information (breaches, serving order, following up breaching a bench warrant) being held by separate individual Gardaí on different shifts at different stations **with no cooperation or coordination**.

Negative responses

On the other hand, negative feedback is largely linked to responses that:

- fail to follow AGS Domestic Abuse Policy, including not pursuing a pro-arrest policy for breaches of protective orders
- demonstrate a lack of understanding of domestic abuse and coercive control and concerning gaps in knowledge of relevant legislation and protocols
- fail to affirm that (per law) domestic abuse is not only physical abuse (indeed may occur without physical assault in some instance – particularly of coercive control)



- are due to lack of communication with the woman and/or within the Station
- are due to a lack of systems for appropriate information sharing within the justice system and/or with Tusla.

Recent examples of negative responses from An Garda Síochána which victims-survivors disclosed include:

- arresting her (or both her and her partner) after she called the Gardaí for help
- discouraging her from making a report
- failing to enforce orders under the Domestic Violence Act 2018, including failure to arrest and/or charge respondents even after a number of breaches of protective orders and not being clear as to what constitutes a breach
- telling women that nothing can be done without an order when an assault or another offence has been committed, despite offences of assault/other criminal charges which could be invoked
- after serious and violent crimes against women were carried out in public the women were removed from the situation rather than the perpetrators
- saying that nothing can be done without evidence of **physical** abuse
- not taking her seriously, minimising the abuse and her fears, being dismissive, siding with the abuser, telling the woman she is wasting their time or telling her not to call the Gardaí again
- not turning up for a long time after an emergency call or not turning up at all



- not taking statements, taking inaccurate/incomplete statements, refusing to take statements if she does not immediately agree to pressing charges
- providing incorrect information about orders under the Domestic
 Violence Act 2018 for example on eligibility criteria
- not attending court to give evidence in domestic violence orders applications
- knowing the abuser in a personal capacity and therefore failing to take action
- forgetting to/ not serving orders quickly due to lack of time (including for months) or because the perpetrator is hard to locate
- not removing firearms from the perpetrator, even after threats to her safety
- women have shared experiences where Gardaí are either not trained or up to date on proper protocols, and as a result incorrectly collected evidence was not usable in court.

Lack of understanding of Domestic abuse and of legislation

Many of the above negative responses point to a lack of understanding of domestic abuse (especially coercive control) and a lack of a victim centered approach, which would allow Gardai to fully understand the gravity and severity of psychological harm that domestic abuse has on victim-survivors.

Worryingly, we also note a lack of consistent understanding of the Domestic Violence Act 2018 with some responding members giving incorrect information on eligibility and process for the different orders, and not being clear on what constitute a breach and when an arrest must be made.

Lack of Consistency

While the majority of contacts as reported to Women's Aid were positive, we cannot overstate the importance of consistency of response. Women subjected to domestic abuse often do not call the Gardaí until after repeated episodes, sometimes after years of abuse. When they do call it is imperative they receive a professional and supportive response **always**.

We have noted that when a woman makes an initial report at the Garda station, the response at the hatch/reception by individual Garda on duty is very inconsistent, with the report not taken seriously and investigated and the woman told to go and get an order.

There must be a robust system in place which ensures that all Gardaí are well equipped to fully understand the gravity and severity of psychological harm that domestic abuse has on victim-survivors and are therefore able to best respond to domestic abuse victims in a sympathetic and supportive manner.

It is important to note that a negative or unsympathetic response undermines faith in the Gardaí and in the justice system in general. Women who receive a negative response are less likely to call on the Gardaí again should they need to, or to stay engaged with the Justice System (particularly the Criminal Justice System). The Egan and O'Malley Dunlop report⁸ found that a negative response could be so distressing as to determine a desire to withdraw from **any** proceedings the victim was involved in (which could be Family Law or Childcare as well as other Criminal Justice proceedings) thus increasing attrition in all systems.

This issue with inconsistency has been noted by Women's Aid for many years and recently by the Policing Authority as well⁹. It is therefore

⁸ Egan, N. and O'Malley Dunlop, E. (2023) op. cit.

⁹ Mazzone, M. (2019) Unheard and Uncounted, Women, Domestic Abuse and the Irish Criminal Justice System. Women's Aid. Available

at: https://www.womensaid.ie/app/uploads/2023/07/unheard_and_uncounted - women domestic abuse and the irish criminal justice system executive summary.pdf



imperative that steps are taken to ensure the response is consistent across individual members and stations, and that it follows the Garda Domestic Abuse Intervention Policy. Initial and ongoing training as well as case supervision and monitoring of adherence to the Policy should be strengthened to achieve this aim.

Communication and information sharing

Other unhelpful responses are due to lack of communication with the woman, or within Garda station/between Stations and to gaps in information sharing between different parts of the Justice system.

For example, women report calling Garda stations multiple times for information on her case, each time talking to a different staff member having to explain her situation over and over, which can cause immense mental health harms, and not receiving any further information. At times, women are directed and re-directed through different stations and services in search of vital information, and again, the information not forthcoming.

It is vital that case information is shared with the woman in a proactive and prompt manner and that there are clear systems for transfer of information in respect of a woman's case within AGS so she does not have to keep explaining her situation and history of contact with members of AGS. Where there is a designated point of contact for the woman, this is extremely helpful, however systems need to be designed so cases are not left unattended due to leave or roster issues of the contact person.

We also find that often women are very unprepared for what will happen in the Criminal court, have no idea about what evidence will be presented, whether they need to be there and when and often do not even know what the investigation Garda looks like before they go into court. Better communication around and information on criminal justice proceedings is needed to make the process more victim-centric, which

Policing Authority, 2022, What we heard, https://www.policingauthority.ie/assets/uploads/documents/What We Heard 2022.pdf

may also support the woman remaining engaged with the criminal justice system and reduce attrition.

While this is not only a Garda Strategy issue, information sharing between parts of the Justice system must be improved and systematised. This includes information being shared between different Garda stations, with the Prison Service and the Probation service and with the Family and Criminal courts (and with Tusla as appropriate), with the aim of maximising victims' safety.

For example, when a protective order is granted, there should be an automated electronic transfer from the Courts to the PULSE system, rather than the woman having to physically bring an order to a Garda Station and then having to ring the station several times to find out if the order has been served on the respondent- this is not a victim-centred approach.

Conversely, information on breaches of orders and other offences or warrants need to be automatically made available to Courts dealing with custody and access proceedings.

Where the information is not available there should be a clear timeline of information sharing and when there is a delay, this should be communicated in a timely manner along with an explanation as well as a new date and contact details to allow for follow up.

Domestic Violence Liaison Gardaí / Domestic Abuse Coordination Teams

In relation to Domestic Violence Liaison Gardaí, in our experience there is a lot of initial contact but less follow through, as one Liaison Gardaí per district is not able to provide ongoing support to all domestic abuse victim-survivors. There are also inconsistencies between districts.

Women's Aid welcomes the establishment of Domestic Abuse Coordination Teams, which at present are mainly available in the DMR. We support the national roll out and full resourcing of these teams. Women's Aid has delivered training of some teams but note that there



is an inconsistent approach to training from division to division. Consistent training packages, including specialist training such as can be offered by Women's Aid should be put in place to ensure consistency.

Risk assessment

Women's Aid appreciates the roll out of the Garda risk assessment tool, to determine level of risk to victims and identify any protection measures needed. However, risk assessments can easily become blunt tools and their implementation and oversight of appropriate application is critical to ensure that they enhance victim safety.

It is important that there are protocols to monitor such measures. For example, the Inspector or Superintendent in a station should regularly review risk assessments to ensure that appropriate follow up actions have actually happened and are effective.

The risk assessment tool can be improved by including some additional factors, as suggested by GREVIO. Importantly, risk assessment must also include any children of the victim, who are often also at risk of harm by the perpetrator, especially after separation. ¹⁰

Crucially, Women's Aid has previously advised AGS that a form of evaluation of the roll out of this tool must include specialist Services and victims-survivors themselves. This will allow for constructive feedback on any risk assessment tool which relies for its success heavily upon the 'soft skills' of the member using it. The timing of questions, the manner and context in which they are asked, and the actions taken following the completion of these tools require continuous review and evaluation. This should be built explicitly into the Garda strategy. Feedback exclusively from AGS members themselves will only give one perspective and is insufficient.

¹⁰ Recommendation 44, GREVIO Baseline Evaluation Report, 2023, IRELAND, https://rm.coe.int/grevio-s-baseline-evaluation-report-on-legislative-and-other-measures-/1680ad3feb



Issues with arrests, charging and investigations

Women's Aid notes a very welcome increase in Domestic abuse calls, incidents recorded and charged in the latest AGS Annual Report¹¹, as well as the increase in prosecution of the new offences under the Harassment, Harmful Communications and Related Offences Act 2020.¹²

Notwithstanding recent progress, it is clear that prosecution for breaches of protective orders under the Domestic Violence Act and other domestic violence related offences must still be improved.

Women report to us that, in certain cases, arrests have not been made following a breach of an order, with the attending Garda choosing to deal with the breach 'informally', or not at all, contrary to Garda policy. This is confirmed by the Egan and O'Malley Dunlop report, which also notes there is still reluctance to prosecute breaches in certain areas¹³.

We support their recommendation to "conduct a State-wide review by An Garda Síochána of those practices within the organisation regarding the investigation and prosecution of offences under Section 33 of the Act of 2018 and, thereafter, the adoption and implementation of an appropriate uniform policy amongst An Garda Síochána regarding the consistent and prompt investigation and prosecution of offences under that Section".

The recent GREVIO report also recommends that the Police should "proactively monitor and promptly enforce interim, emergency barring orders and other protection/restraining orders" to comply with the Istanbul Convention¹⁴.

When offenders are arrested for a breach, that is often the only charge that is pressed by the Gardaí, even when other and possibly more severe offences have been committed. For example, threats, assault or

¹¹ ANNUAL REPORT AN GARDA SÍOCHÁNA 100 Years of Keeping People Safe, 2022, www.garda.ie

¹² https://www.buzz.ie/news/105-new-charges-brought-cocos-29789426

¹³ Egan, N. and O'Malley Dunlop, E. (2023) op. cit. Page 42

¹⁴ Recommendation 46h, GREVIO, 2023, op.cit

coercive control. This can affect sentencing. It also minimises and diminishes the victim-survivors experiences.

In other cases, perpetrators are not arrested when there is no order under the Domestic Violence Act. In these cases, Gardaí may say that there is nothing they can do without an order. Even in cases where a number of other offences (such as assault, threats, damage to property etc.) have been committed and could be investigated. We very often hear that when a victim-survivor calls the Gardaí for the first time, the only response they get is that they need to apply for an order in the district court. This is despite the fact that an offence may have already been committed. Moreover, the case often relies mostly or only on the victim's statement as evidence rather than additional evidence that might be found through investigation. This places an undue burden on the victim, who may be, with good reason, terrified of retaliation.

The GREVIO report notices this over-reliance on women's testimony and recommends that further measures are taken "to improve the collection of evidence in all cases of violence against women and ensure that legislation allowing the initial statement made by the victim to the police to be admitted as evidence is applied in practice, so that reliance on the victim's testimony is lessened"¹⁵.

In this regard we support Action 3.5.3 of the Third National Strategy on Domestic Sexual and Gender-Based Violence(DSGBV) "Improve prosecutions of breaches of any and all DSGBV civil orders provided for in domestic violence and family law legislation" and Action 3.3.3¹⁶ regarding consideration of best practice and would like to be made aware of any new best practice or initiative which has been considered.

¹⁵ Recommendation 43 f, GREVIO Baseline Evaluation Report, 2023, IRELAND, https://rm.coe.int/grevio-s-baseline-evaluation-report-on-legislative-and-other-measures-/1680ad3feb

¹⁶ Action 3.3.3 An Garda Síochána will consider emerging international initiatives or best practice to aid the policing and prosecution of DSGBV and will support the practical and operational implementation of any measures identified by the Department of Justice during the aforementioned review cycle.



Training

The Egan and O'Malley Dunlop report notes that there can be a marked difference in the experiences of victims when Gardaí has had the opportunity of training compared to those who have not¹⁷.

We appreciate the training developed by the Garda National Protective Services Bureau and delivered to members of AGS, including on coercive control.

In order to engage with victims-survivors and minimise harm, domestic violence and abuse training should include an understanding of the dynamics and impacts of domestic violence and abuse, especially coercive control (which does not have to include physical abuse). Training should also include an examination of the victims -survivors ability to engage with the Criminal justice system and information on supports when traumatized by such abuse.

Specialist domestic and sexual violence organisations should be involved in the design and delivery of training to bring in the perspectives of specialist practitioners and victims-survivors. Importantly training should be delivered to **all** members of AGS, including CAD call takers. This is particularly important whereby most domestic violence and abuse calls are responded to by local Divisional units and not specialist DPUs. Dedicated focus on domestic violence and abuse including coercive control, Garda policy on same, and connection with the other most common offences associated with domestic abuse (Intimate Image Abuse, Harassment, stalking, non-fatal strangulation, assault causing harm) should be a component of all Gardaí trainees at the point of recruitment, with ongoing CPD opportunities created to ensure knowledge and best practice retention.

A number of relevant new offences have been enacted in the past few years, including Intimate image abuse (imaged based sexual abuse) in the Harassment, Harmful Communications and Related Offences Act 2020, non-fatal strangulation/suffocation and stalking offences in the

¹⁷ Egan, N. and O'Malley Dunlop, E. (2023) op. cit. Pages 32 and 42



very recent Criminal Justice (Miscellaneous Provisions) Act 2023. It is very important that all current serving Gardaí are trained and supported in dealing with these offences, including when perpetrated by current or former intimate partners.

We note and agree with the GREVIO recommendations regarding training and development of internal policies for the Police response to domestic abuse, which would improve consistency of response, including for minority groups.¹⁸

CAD/Emergency call responses

Following the revelations of thousands of CAD/999 calls being cancelled in recent times, Women's Aid acknowledges the work done to address weak points both in technical and human response systems to ensure that no caller reporting domestic or sexual violence is left without a high priority Garda response. However, there should be a formal process of continuous 'spot' checking by senior members of both technical systems and CAD dispatcher responses and data recording to ensure that there is no slippage or further disregarding of emergency calls in these circumstances.

Recommendations:

- 2.1 The proactive approach of Operation Faoiseamh should continue and should be included in the Strategic Plan. This should include proactive monitoring and enforcing of orders under the Domestic Violence Act 2018.
- 2.2 Training on domestic violence and abuse should be prioritised, both at foundation level in the Garda College and as CDP for serving Gardaí in order to ensure a consistent response in line with the Garda Domestic Abuse Intervention Policy. The training should include an understanding of the dynamics of domestic violence and abuse, especially coercive control, and

¹⁸ Recommendation 43, GREVIO Baseline Evaluation Report, 2023, IRELAND, https://rm.coe.int/grevio-s-baseline-evaluation-report-on-legislative-and-other-measures-/1680ad3feb

- should be designed and delivered in conjunction with relevant specialist support services. Training should be provided to all members of An Garda Síochána that may respond to and/or investigate a domestic abuse call. CAD dispatchers should also be trained.
- 2.3 Training on prosecuting new offences, especially image based sexual abuse and stalking, should be provided and should include correct protocols for evidence collection.
- 2.4 Monitoring of the consistent implementation of the Domestic Abuse Intervention policy and domestic abuse case supervision should be strengthened.
- 2.5 Risk assessment should be rolled out nationally to all victims of domestic abuse and must include **their children**. The Risk Assessment tool should be further refined to take into consideration the factors mentioned in GREVIO's recommendation 44.
- 2.6 An evaluation of the initial roll out of the Risk Assessment Tool should be undertaken to include significant input from specialist DVA services and victims-survivors who have experienced administration of this tool.
- 2.7 Improving prosecution for domestic violence and abuse related offences, including but not limited to breaches of DV orders and coercive control, should remain a priority in the new Strategic Plan. This should include conducting a review of current practices.
- 2.8 Gardai who act in the role of prosecution for breaches of orders and other domestic abuse offences, must be trained to do so effectively, including in relation to circumstances where refusal of bail may be applied for, even regarding summary offences, where there is a significant potential risk of harm to the victimsurvivor.



- 2.9 Victim-centric information and communication processes need to be developed so that domestic abuse victims are informed and prepared for attending criminal court as witnesses.
- 2.10 A formal process of continuous 'spot' checking by senior members of both technical systems and CAD dispatcher responses and data recording should be put in place to ensure all domestic violence calls are responded to.
- 2.11 Information sharing procedures and systems within the Justice System and where appropriate Tusla need to be developed and applied.
- 2.12 Resources must be made available to put supportive protocols and case management systems in place. Gardaí staffing should be adequately resourced so that there is consistent capacity to support women and engagement with Domestic Violence Services and these roles should be specially trained and resourced.
- 2.13 Protocols for keeping victims informed of their cases should be developed.
- 2.14 Continue the roll out of Domestic Abuse Coordination Teams nationally and fully resource them.

Gardaí as Offenders or Friends of Offenders

Over the years, Women's Aid has heard of a small but important number of cases where the perpetrator was either a Garda, a Garda informant, or a relative/close friend of a Garda. Several such cases have been reported in the press¹⁹. Many of the victims-survivors in this situation told us that they felt they could not call the Gardaí or, having called, received an unhelpful response.

¹⁹ https://www.irishtimes.com/crime-law/2022/06/30/twenty-six-gardai-serving-suspensions-for-domestic-violence-or-sexual-misconduct-allegations/



While the number of women in such situations is small, their circumstances are very dangerous and difficult. It would be helpful for them to know whom to go to and what procedures and precautions the Gardaí would take to protect them if they were to make a report against a domestic violence and abuse perpetrator who is a member of AGS. There needs to be clear guidelines on how Gardaí would deal with this situation, and **these guidelines need to be easily accessible to the public**, (for example in the Domestic Abuse section of the AGS website) so that victims-survivors in these cases can be reassured and are not prevented from coming forward.

We are also concerned that a Garda perpetrator of domestic violence and abuse may have access to PULSE records about his partner and former partner(s) and any incidents recorded therein and may also be able to modify such records. We would like clarifications on whether there are measures to prevent this from happening.

Women's Aid welcomed the appointment of Pat Clavin by the Garda Commissioner, in November 2021, to examine all 'sexual, gender-based domestic violence and coercive control related crimes involving members of An Garda Síochána'²⁰ over the previous five years. We call on the Garda Commissioner to make the findings and recommendations that Assistant Commissioner Clavin arrives at public, along with clear indications of how such recommendations will be implemented, including timeframes for same.

Women's Aid also calls on the Commissioner to ensure that effective measures are in place to ensure that the requirement that Members of An Garda Síochána to report the existence of a domestic violence order, for which they are a respondent, under the Domestic Violence Act 2018 in accordance with An Garda Síochána's Domestic Abuse Intervention Policy, to the Internal Affairs Unit are correctly complied with in all cases. Where orders are in place, mitigation measures to protect victims should be put in place (e.g., checks on a member's access

²⁰ Domestic violence cases perpetrated by Gardaí to be examined, 2021.



to/use of the PULSE system to ensure this access is not abused; a designated senior member as liaison to victims-survivors to ensure confidence in the institution).

When the mechanism for victims of stalking to apply for civil restraining orders is commenced (Criminal Justice (Miscellaneous provisions) Act 2023), members of the Gardai must similarly be obliged to disclose to their employer if they are subject to any such order, and appropriate steps taken to ensure that they cannot abuse their position to perpetuate any further monitoring or abuse of the victim (e.g. access to the PUSLE system).

Recruitment screening processes for Garda members should include exclusion if they have been subject to credible allegations of domestic abuse.

Recommendations:

- 2.15 That clear guidelines on how Garda would deal with domestic violence cases when the perpetrator is a member of (or a friend of) a Garda or Garda informant are developed and made available to the public.
- 2.16 Findings of Assistant Commissioner Clavin's review on domestic, sexual, gender-based violence and coercive control related crimes involving Gardaí perpetrators should be published. Any recommendations should be enacted to mitigate risk and ensure transparency and public confidence.
- 2.17 Effective measures should be put in place to ensure that the requirement that Members of An Garda Síochána to report the existence of an order, for which they are a respondent, under the Domestic Violence Act 2018 in accordance with An Garda Síochána's Domestic Abuse Intervention Policy, to the Internal Affairs Unit is complied with in all cases.



- 2.18 Similarly, when the mechanism for victims of stalking to apply for civil restraining orders is commenced (Criminal Justice (Miscellaneous Provisions) Act 2023), members of the Gardaí must be obliged to disclose to their employer if they are subject to any such order.
- 2.19 Suitable risk mitigation measures should be implemented to protect victims-survivors and ensure confidence in the Institution if the perpetrator is a Member of An Garda Síochána.
- 2.20 Recruitment screening processes for Garda members should include exclusion if they have been subject to credible allegations of domestic abuse.

Finally, certain groups, for example Travellers, other ethnic minorities, and migrant, asylum seeking/refugee women may have less trust in police. They may not be aware of their rights, the legislation in Ireland or the help the Gardaí can provide in relation to domestic abuse, coercive control, and online abuse. Such women experience more barriers to reporting and report a less positive response when they do²¹.

At the same time, these groups can be particularly vulnerable to domestic violence and abuse so special attention should be given to training Garda members in anti-racism, unconscious bias training and trauma informed responses particularly to support better engagement with these minoritized and sometime vulnerable populations. Community liaison functions can also support trust building among these communities.

Recommendations:

2.21 Actions to improve trust and reporting by minority groups and response to them should be included in the Strategic Plan in

²¹ Egan, N. and O'Malley Dunlop, E. (2023) op. cit., page 43

line with Action 4.6.2 of the Third National Strategy on Domestic, Sexual and Gender-based violence²².

- 2.22 Increasing dedicated community liaison roles and training Garda members in anti-racism, unconscious bias and trauma informed responses particularly to support better engagement with victims of DSGBV among minoritized groups should be actions in the new strategy.
- 3. How can we work in partnership with you, or with other partners, to further ensure the safety of our communities?

Women's Aid values our collaboration with An Garda Síochána, which we would be delighted to continue and expand as suggested below.

Expansion of High-Risk Support Project

The High-Risk Support Project is a successful partnership between Women's Aid, An Garda Síochána and Vodafone Foundation Ireland, with support from local domestic violence services. It provides a coordinated, rapid response to women at a high-risk of ongoing violence, abuse and homicide from their ex-partners and ex-spouses. This project has proven to be a very positive collaboration which is of great value to survivors, and it has been positively evaluated. In 2022, this project supported 266 women, 1 man and 578 children²³.

Women's Aid are delighted to continue this collaboration with An Garda Siochána to extend the High-Risk Support Project(HRSP) nationally. The HRSP went 'live' in the Eastern Region in quarter 4 2023 and we look forward to achieving national coverage by the end of quarter 2 2024.

²² Department of Justice (2022a) Third National Strategy on Domestic, Sexual & Gender-Based Violence Implementation Plan. Government of Ireland. Available at:https://www.gov.ie/pdf/?file=https://assets.gov.ie/228481/69e48889-49ea-49d6-8143-982f6cc28bac.pdf#page=nu

²³ Women's Aid Annual Impact Report 2022



This project is an excellent example of a co-operative partnership between a specialist charity, statutory body and corporate partner that is saving lives in Ireland.

The HRSP is building bridges between local services and local Garda stations, which provides an opportunity for Garda, and in particular for DACs to proactively link to their local services and refer to the HRSP systematically.

Training

As mentioned above, Women's Aid believes that training both at Foundation level and as CDP is essential to ensure consistency of response in line with An Garda Síochána policy.

We believe that certain aspects of the training relating to understanding the experience of the victims, the impact of coercive control and of trauma, and best practice responses prioritising their safety is best designed and delivered jointly with specialist support services with extensive experience working with victims-survivors.

From the mid-1990s to 2019 Women's Aid delivered training to phase III/post placement Garda students in the Garda College and has since provided a number of workshops on an ad hoc basis to different divisions and to various Garda stations on request. Members of An Garda Síochána have also frequently attended Women's Aid mixed audiences training events.

Women's Aid would be delighted to provide more regular training and have indicated our willingness to bring our decades of best practice training expertise and collaborate with those involved in designing and delivering training to members on this subject.

Training on new legislation

When new relevant legislation is enacted, it may be useful for Garda and specialist services to have joint inter-agency training on it. An example where this could be considered are the recently enacted

offences of non-fatal strangulation/suffocation²⁴ to understand why this is so important and high risk.

Many women report to Women's Aid that they have been subjected to non-fatal strangulation/suffocation incidents and we would be able to bring their voices and experiences to joint training, while learning about Garda new powers to prosecute these offences.

Recommendations:

- 3.1 Women's Aid would be delighted to provide more regular training and have indicated our willingness to bring our decades of best practice training expertise and collaborate with those involved in designing and delivering training to members on this subject.
- 3.2 When new relevant legislation is enacted, it may be useful for Garda and specialist services to have joint inter-agency training on it. An example where this could be considered are the recently enacted offences of non-fatal strangulation/suffocation²⁵ to understand why this is so important and high risk.
 - 4. An Garda Síochána is a victim-centred organisation, how can we further collaborate with our partners, in a proactive and inclusive way, to support victims and serve our communities to the highest standards?

Firstly, we would like to reiterate that the proactive approach of Operation Faoiseamh. This has been very positive for victims-survivors of domestic violence and abuse and should continue, as well as existing collaboration with and referrals to domestic violence and abuse specialist organisations.

²⁴ Criminal Justice (Miscellaneous Provisions) Act 2023

²⁵ Criminal Justice (Miscellaneous Provisions) Act 2023



Women's Aid would also like to suggest the following further ways of supporting victims of DVA:

Serving of Orders under the Domestic Violence Act 2018

In our experience, most women have to notify an abusive partner that an order has been granted against him, which may put her at risk of violence or retaliation. This happens frequently in the case of barring orders and interim barring orders, where the respondent may be extremely angry that they have to leave the home and may resist doing so. We also find that defendants of breaches regularly put forward the defense that they have not been served the order and it may be impossible for the woman to prove she did serve it.

In certain cases, Gardaí notify the respondent about an order, and this is much appreciated by the women as it increases their level of safety. However, we are aware of cases where the Gardaí, after undertaking to serve orders, don't do so immediately – in some cases waiting for long periods to do so or do not serve them at all. This is a very serious issue as victims remain unprotected by law and they may not always be aware that the order has not been served.

Women's Aid is aware that this is an issue that may have resource implications and where cooperation with the courts is necessary. However, we believe that An Garda Síochána should have a defined role in serving protective orders due to safety issues and to ensure proper recording of the order having been served.

Recommendations:

4.1 Women's Aid recommends that AGS new Strategic Plan should include a commitment to serving orders, particularly in relation to emergency barring orders, interim barring orders and barring orders under the Domestic Violence Act 2018, to perpetrators.

Special sittings under S24

Section 24 of the Domestic Violence Act 2018 provides for a mechanism to address the issue of domestic abuse victims-survivors in an emergency situation needing orders when the court is not sitting. Under this provision, a Garda not below the rank of sergeant may request that the court service arrange a special sitting of the District Court for the purposes of an out-of-hours application for an interim barring order, protection order or emergency barring order.

Women's Aid strongly lobbied for this measure so as to provide an option for women and children who may otherwise have to flee the home and wait until the Courts are open to apply for an order, with the possibility of having no safe place to go in the meantime.

Women's Aid would like An Garda Síochána to publish annual figures regarding the number of times Gardaí have requested these special sittings for an out-of-hours application for an emergency order. An assessment should be made as to whether there have been any barriers in utilising this provision. This assessment should be furthered to examine the level of training/awareness done and confidence among Members regarding this provision as an option to support victims-survivors in particularly acute situations. Gaps in training and awareness should be overcome through appropriate training and provision of information.

Recommendation:

4.2 The Strategic Plan should include measures to monitor and if necessary, support the use of S24 of the Domestic Violence Act 2018.

Collaboration in other legal processes to support victims

Women's Aid 2019 report²⁶ found that women experiencing domestic abuse can be dealing with a number of consecutive or concurrent legal processes including the criminal courts, the civil courts (for Domestic Violence orders or for Custody and Access orders) and Child protection proceeding. This was recently confirmed by the Egan and O'Malley Dunlop report, which found that these processes often work in isolation despite potential benefits for victims if they were to collaborate better²⁷.

In relation to Gardaí specifically, Egan and O'Malley Dunlop make several recommendations that would support victims by avoiding them having to make multiple statements in different settings and by allowing information from one process to be used in another to corroborate a victim's story. In particular, we note that the Report concludes that "the members of An Garda Síochána are **obliged** in appropriate circumstances to give evidence in applications under the Domestic Violence Act 2018 **and in access and custody applications** in which there is underlying relational violence" 28.

In our experience when Gardaí do attend Family Court hearings to provide evidence for Domestic Violence orders, this is very welcome and experienced as very supportive by women. We also know that Custody and Access proceedings in the context of domestic abuse are very distressful and difficult for women, who may have to prove in the Family Court the danger the abuser poses to their children and themselves, even when there is already evidence of such risk and harm in the criminal justice system. Women's Aid therefore strongly supports the below recommendation:

6.2.6 (d) That An Garda Síochána review and adapt its practices regarding the giving of evidence in appropriate circumstances in Domestic Violence Act applications **and in access and custody**

²⁶ Mazzone, M. (2019), op. cit.

²⁷ Egan, N. and O'Malley Dunlop, E. (2023) op. cit.

²⁸ Egan, N. and O'Malley Dunlop, E. (2023) op. cit. page 65, paragraph 5.7.10, bold added



applications in which there is underlying domestic or sexual violence. In doing so, An Garda Síochána to devise guidelines regarding the conduct, on a case-by-case basis, of an assessment of whether evidence may be given without causing any prejudice to a criminal investigation or prosecution.²⁹.

We also support other recommendations made in the report in relation to avoiding delays and collaborative practices and sharing of information between the Gardaí, Tusla and the Family Courts, which would be supportive to child and adult victims and recommend that An Garda Síochána Strategic Plan considers how to implement relevant Recommendations 6.2.4, 6.2.6, 6.2.7 in the Report.

We note that Action 3.2.2³⁰ of the Third National Strategy on DSGBV is a step in this direction towards better collaboration with the Family Courts and would be interested in any update on such action.

Recommendations:

The Strategic Plan should:

- 4.3 include measures to strengthened Gardaí providing evidence in Domestic Violence Act applications and in access and custody applications in which there is underlying domestic or sexual violence
- 4.4 consider how to implement Recommendations 6.2.4, 6.2.6, 6.2.7 in the Egan and O'Malley Dunlop Report
- 4.5 implement and report on Action 3.2.2 of the Third National Strategy on DSGBV.

²⁹ Egan, N. and O'Malley Dunlop, E. (2023) op. cit. page 82, bold added

³⁰ Action 3.2.2 Explore the interface and interaction of the Family Law Courts and PULSE to aid Domestic Violence Act orders and improve the service and recording of Domestic Violence Act orders by reviewing how they currently operate.



Domestic and family violence deaths/familicides

Women's Aid welcomed the publishing of the Study on Familicide & Domestic and Family Violence Death Reviews³¹. Many recommendations therein are relevant to An Garda Síochána and should be considered in the drafting of the Strategic Plan.

We would like to draw attention to Recommendations in Chapter Four relating to An Garda Síochána developing a coordinated media response for domestic and family violence deaths, and recommendations in Chapter Six on development of a common multiagency risk assessment tool for adults and for children and management of high-risk cases.

We are aware that DPSUs already use a risk assessment for adult victims of domestic violence and abuse, but it is unclear whether such assessment is also used by or shared with other relevant agencies and whether there is a specific tool for children.

Recommendation:

4.6 The Strategic Plan should consider relevant actions to implement Recommendations in Chapters Four and Six of the Study on Familicide & Domestic and Family Violence Death Reviews.

Data on Domestic abuse

The AGS 2022 report on Domestic, Sexual and Gender-Based Violence³² was very informative and could be a good benchmark to evaluate further progress. Information on the distinct offence of coercive control, on offences under the Harassment, Harmful Communications and Related Offences Act 2020 and offences under the

³¹ Butler, M. (2023) A Study on Familicide & Domestic and Family Violence Death Reviews. Government of Ireland. Available at: https://www.gov.ie/pdf/?file=https://assets.gov.ie/259211/8390d71a-7a42-4b49-b508-21316d6e2b35.pdf#page=null

³² An Garda Síochána, 2022, DOMESTIC, SEXUAL AND GENDER-BASED VIOLENCE A Report on Crime Levels and Garda Operational Response



Criminal Justice (Miscellaneous Provisions) Act 2023 should be included in any new analysis.

Recommendation:

4.7 To repeat the Domestic, Sexual and Gender-Based Violence report on a regular basis, including information on new relevant offences.

Information on Garda organisational structure for responding to domestic abuse

Women's Aid believe both specialist organisations and victims-survivors of domestic abuse could benefit from more easily accessible information on the Garda structures responding to domestic abuse, including local ones (for example DACs).

This information is not available in the Domestic Abuse section of the Garda website, and neither is the Garda domestic Abuse Intervention Policy

As previously suggested information on what to do when the perpetrator is a member of AGS should also be easily accessible.

Recommendation:

4.8 That the domestic abuse section in Garda website is updated to include information on the Garda structures dealing with domestic abuse and relevant Garda policy, including when perpetrators are members of AGS.

The following pillars were included in the Strategy Statement 2022-2025;

- o Community
- o Tackling Crime and Preventative Policing
- Victims and the Vulnerable
- o Protecting the Security of the Irish State

o Sustainable Change and innovation

5. Are there any other areas you feel should be considered for inclusion in our next strategy period?

Women and children are already disproportionally subjected to online violence, such as cyber-harassment and online image abuse and it seems that new technologies, which can create harmful media such as deepfakes³³, are also going to impact on them more.

Recommendation:

5.1 Women's Aid suggests a focus on online crime, particularity online violence against women and children as one of the Pillars for the next strategy. Contrasting these crimes will require increased resources and specific skills, not easily or quickly acquired, which should be planned for in the next Strategy.

^{33 &}lt;u>https://www.politico.com/newsletters/women-rule/2023/05/19/women-and-the-dark-side-of-ai-00097853</u>

The State of Deepfakes: Landscape, Threats, and Impact, Henry Ajder, Giorgio Patrini, Francesco Cavalli, and Laurence Cullen, September 2019

